

*Parties and counsel listed on signature pages*

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT  
ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY  
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

Case No. 4:22-MD-03047  
MDL No. 3047

**JOINT STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~  
ORDER REGARDING WITHDRAWAL OF  
COUNSEL**

\_\_\_\_\_  
This Document Relates to:

ALL ACTIONS

The Personal Injury Plaintiffs (“PI Plaintiffs”) and Defendants (collectively with Plaintiffs, the “Parties”), hereby submit the following Stipulation and [Proposed] Order Regarding Withdrawal of Counsel.

WHEREAS, PI Plaintiffs have informed the Court and Defendants that counsel for certain personal injury plaintiffs have been unable to make contact with their clients. In some but not all of these cases, counsel for the unresponsive plaintiffs have indicated that they intend to move to withdraw.

WHEREAS, the PI Plaintiffs and Defendants agree that where a plaintiff is unresponsive to counsel, counsel should be permitted to withdraw and the plaintiff’s claims should be dismissed for failure to prosecute if the plaintiff, having received adequate notice, does not re-engage and advise the Court of a desire to proceed. The PI Plaintiffs and Defendants propose

1 below a protocol for handling attorney withdrawal and dismissal under Rule 41(b) in these  
2 circumstances.

3 WHEREAS, under Civil Local Rule 11-5, counsel may withdraw from representation  
4 only with the Court's permission. The Court has discretion to determine whether a request to  
5 withdraw is made with good cause. In exercising this discretion, it applies California Rule of  
6 Professional Conduct 1.16(b), which lists factors warranting permissive withdrawal of counsel.  
7 Under the Rule, withdrawal is permissible where the client's conduct "renders it unreasonably  
8 difficult for the lawyer to carry out the representation effectively." Cal. Rule of Prof'l Conduct  
9 1.16(b)(4).

10 WHEREAS, it is unreasonably difficult for a personal injury plaintiff's counsel to carry  
11 out the representation in this MDL if the plaintiff fails or refuses to communicate with counsel.  
12 See *Tikotzky v. Remax Real Pros*, 2020 WL 13281523, at \*1 (C.D. Cal. Oct. 13, 2020); *Connally*  
13 *v. Cafe*, 2016 WL 1697937, at \*2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 28, 2016); *Ortiz v. Freitas*, 2015 WL 3826151,  
14 at \*2 (N.D. Cal. June 18, 2015) ("Mr. Ortiz's failure to maintain regular contact with his counsel  
15 and cooperate in moving the litigation forward constitutes good cause for withdrawal."). Where  
16 both the Court and counsel have provided explicit written notice, permitting withdrawal does not  
17 cause harm to the administration of justice and will advance, rather than delay, the ultimate  
18 resolution of the plaintiff's case. See *In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., &*  
19 *Prod. Liab. Litig.*, 2019 WL 13268604, at \*1 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 30, 2019). This may be so even if  
20 the client does not consent to the withdrawal. *Robinson v. Delgado*, 2010 WL 3259384, at \*2  
21 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 18, 2010) (noting that the "consent of the client is not dispositive").

22 WHEREAS, Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 41(b) provides for the involuntary dismissal  
23 of an action when "the plaintiff fails to prosecute or to comply with these rules or a court order."  
24 Fed. R. Civ. P. 41(b). "District courts have the inherent power to control their dockets and, '[i]n  
25 the exercise of that power they may impose sanctions including, where appropriate, . . . dismissal  
26 of a case.'" *Ferdik v. Bonzelet*, 963 F.2d 1258, 1260 (9th Cir. 1992) (citation omitted). The need  
27 for vigilance in maintaining control over the Court's docket and promoting efficient conduct of  
28

1 the litigation is more acute, and the Court’s discretion is accordingly greater, in the context of  
 2 multidistrict litigation. *In re Phenylpropanolamine (PPA) Prods. Liability Litig.*, 460 F.3d 1217,  
 3 1226 (9th Cir. 2006); see also *In re Guidant Corp. Implantable Defibrillators Prods. Liab. Litig.*,  
 4 496 F.3d 863, 867 (8th Cir. 2007) (noting that “MDL courts must be given greater discretion to  
 5 organize, coordinate and adjudicate its proceedings, including the dismissal of cases for failure to  
 6 comply with its orders”). The Court has the power to dismiss an action sua sponte for failure to  
 7 prosecute. *Ash v. Cvetkov*, 739 F.2d 493, 496 (9th Cir. 1984).

8 WHEREAS, when determining whether to dismiss an action for failure to prosecute,  
 9 courts weigh five factors: “(1) the public’s interest in expeditious resolution of litigation; (2) the  
 10 court’s need to manage its docket; (3) the risk of prejudice to the defendants; (4) the public  
 11 policy favoring disposition of cases on their merits; and (5) the availability of less drastic  
 12 sanctions.” *In re PPA*, 460 F.3d at 1226 (citation omitted). Taking these factors into  
 13 consideration, several courts in the Ninth Circuit have ruled that a plaintiff who fails or refuses to  
 14 communicate with their attorneys should at least be required to show cause why their case should  
 15 not be dismissed. See *Williams v. County of Fresno*, 2022 WL 209327 (E.D. Cal. Mar. 3, 2022)  
 16 (recommending dismissal)<sup>1</sup>; *McConnell v. United States*, 2021 WL 4818946 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 15,  
 17 2021) (ordering the plaintiff to show cause).

18 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, SUBJECT TO  
 19 THE COURT’S APPROVAL:

20 1. If counsel for any personal injury plaintiff has lost the ability to communicate  
 21 effectively with that plaintiff, counsel should move the Court for permission to withdraw  
 22 pursuant to Civil Local Rule 11-5. In so moving, Plaintiff’s counsel must document that his or  
 23 her client has repeatedly failed to respond to counsel’s communications in a manner consistent  
 24 with counsel’s confidentiality obligations.

---

25  
 26  
 27 <sup>1</sup> *Findings and recommendations adopted*, 2022 WL 624567 (E.D. Cal. Mar. 3, 2022).

1           2. The Court will then enter a show-cause order (attached hereto as Exhibit A)  
2 directing the plaintiff to advise the court in writing within **thirty-five (35) days** whether he or  
3 she intends to proceed with the case, either through current counsel, with substitute counsel, or  
4 without counsel. The order will advise the plaintiff that if the plaintiff responds to the Court that  
5 he or she no longer desires to proceed with the case, or if the plaintiff fails to respond within the  
6 time provided, the plaintiff's claims will be dismissed for failure to prosecute under Fed. R. Civ.  
7 P. 41(b).

8           3. Simultaneous with any motion to withdraw, the plaintiff's counsel must send to  
9 the plaintiff, by any means available, written notice that counsel has sought the Court's  
10 permission to withdraw because of the failure to communicate.

11           4. Plaintiff's counsel shall mail the Court's show-cause order to the plaintiff at the  
12 plaintiff's home address. The plaintiff's counsel shall be required to make diligent continued  
13 efforts to contact the plaintiff during the 35-day notice period. The plaintiff's counsel shall  
14 promptly inform the Court if it succeeds in re-establishing communication with the plaintiff  
15 during the 35-day notice period.

16           5. If the plaintiff timely responds to the show-cause order, the Court shall exercise  
17 its discretion in determining whether to permit counsel's withdrawal.

18           6. If the plaintiff timely responds to the show-cause order and states that he or she  
19 no longer wishes to proceed with the case, or if the plaintiff fails to respond to the show-cause  
20 order, the Court shall enter an order permitting counsel's withdrawal, and shall separately enter  
21 an order dismissing the plaintiff's claims.

22  
23 **IT IS SO STIPULATED**, through Counsel of Record.

24 Dated: July 21, 2024

25  
26 By: /s/ Lexi J. Hazam

27 LEXI J. HAZAM

28 **LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &**

-4-

**BERNSTEIN, LLP**

275 BATTERY STREET, 29<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR  
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94111-3339

Telephone: 415-956-1000

lhazam@lchb.com

PREVIN WARREN

**MOTLEY RICE LLC**

401 9th Street NW Suite 630

Washington DC 20004

Telephone: 202-386-9610

pwarren@motleyrice.com

Co-Lead Counsel

CHRISTOPHER A. SEEGER

**SEEGER WEISS, LLP**

55 CHALLENGER ROAD, 6<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR

RIDGEFIELD PARK, NJ 07660

Telephone: 973-639-9100

cseeger@seegerweiss.com

Counsel to Co-Lead Counsel

JENNIE LEE ANDERSON

**ANDRUS ANDERSON, LLP**

155 MONTGOMERY STREET, SUITE 900

SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104

Telephone: 415-986-1400

jennie@andrusanderson.com

Liaison Counsel

EMILY C. JEFFCOTT

**MORGAN & MORGAN**

633 WEST FIFTH STREET, SUITE 2652

LOS ANGELES, CA 90071

Telephone: 213-787-8590

ejeffcott@forthepeople.com

JOSEPH VANZANDT

**BEASLEY ALLEN**

234 COMMERCE STREET

MONTGOMERY, LA 36103

Telephone: 334-269-2343

joseph.vanzandt@beasleyallen.com

Federal/State Liaisons

-5-

MATTHEW BERGMAN  
GLENN DRAPER  
**SOCIAL MEDIA VICTIMS LAW CENTER**  
821 SECOND AVENUE, SUITE 2100  
SEATTLE, WA 98104  
Telephone: 206-741-4862  
matt@socialmediavictims.org  
glenn@socialmediavictims.org

JAMES J. BILSBORROW  
**WEITZ & LUXENBERG, PC**  
700 BROADWAY  
NEW YORK, NY 10003  
Telephone: 212-558-5500  
jbilsborrow@weitzlux.com

JAYNE CONROY  
**SIMMONS HANLY CONROY, LLC**  
112 MADISON AVE, 7TH FLOOR  
NEW YORK, NY 10016  
Telephone: 917-882-5522  
jconroy@simmonsfirm.com

ANDRE MURA  
**GIBBS LAW GROUP, LLP**  
1111 BROADWAY, SUITE 2100  
OAKLAND, CA 94607  
Telephone: 510-350-9717  
amm@classlawgroup.com

ALEXANDRA WALSH  
**WALSH LAW**  
1050 Connecticut Ave, NW, Suite 500  
Washington D.C. 20036  
Telephone: 202-780-3014  
awalsh@alexwalshlaw.com

MICHAEL M. WEINKOWITZ  
**LEVIN SEDRAN & BERMAN, LLP**  
510 WALNUT STREET  
SUITE 500  
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106  
Telephone: 215-592-1500  
mweinkowitz@lfsbalw.com

Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Leadership

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

RON AUSTIN  
**RON AUSTIN LAW**  
400 MANHATTAN BLVD.  
HARVEY, LA 70058  
Telephone: 504-227-8100  
raustin@ronaustinlaw.com

PAIGE BOLDT  
**WALSH LAW**  
4 Dominion Drive, Bldg. 3, Suite 100  
San Antonio, TX 78257  
Telephone: 210-448-0500  
PBoldt@alexwalshlaw.com

THOMAS P. CARTMELL  
**WAGSTAFF & CARTMELL LLP**  
4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300  
Kansas City, MO 64112  
Telephone: 816-701-1100  
tcartmell@wcllp.com

SARAH EMERY  
**HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC**  
600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100  
LOUISVILLE, KY 40202  
Telephone: 859-600-6725  
semery@justicestartshere.com

CARRIE GOLDBERG  
**C.A. GOLDBERG, PLLC**  
16 Court St.  
Brooklyn, NY 11241  
Telephone: 646-666-8908  
carrie@cagoldberglaw.com

RONALD E. JOHNSON, JR.  
**HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC**  
600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100  
LOUISVILLE, KY 40202  
Telephone: 859-578-4444  
rjohnson@justicestartshere.com

SIN-TING MARY LIU  
**AYLSTOCK WITKIN KREIS &  
OVERHOLTZ, PLLC**  
17 EAST MAIN STREET, SUITE 200

1 PENSACOLA, FL 32502  
2 Telephone: 510-698-9566  
3 mliu@awkolaw.com

4 JAMES MARSH  
5 **MARSH LAW FIRM PLLC**  
6 31 HUDSON YARDS, 11TH FLOOR  
7 NEW YORK, NY 10001-2170  
8 Telephone: 212-372-3030  
9 jamesmarsh@marshlaw.com

10 JOSEPH E. MELTER  
11 **KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK**  
12 **LLP**  
13 280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD  
14 RADNOR, PA 19087  
15 Telephone: 610-667-7706  
16 jmeltzer@ktmc.com

17 HILLARY NAPPI  
18 **HACH & ROSE LLP**  
19 112 Madison Avenue, 10th Floor  
20 New York, New York 10016  
21 Telephone: 212-213-8311  
22 hnappi@hrsclaw.com

23 EMMIE PAULOS  
24 **LEVIN PAPANTONIO RAFFERTY**  
25 316 SOUTH BAYLEN STREET, SUITE 600  
26 PENSACOLA, FL 32502  
27 Telephone: 850-435-7107  
28 epaulos@levinlaw.com

RUTH THI RIZKALLA  
**THE CARLSON LAW FIRM, PC**  
1500 ROSECRANS AVE., STE. 500  
MANHATTAN BEACH, CA 90266  
Telephone: 415-308-1915  
rrizkalla@carlsonattorneys.com

ROLAND TELLIS  
DAVID FERNANDES  
**BARON & BUDD, P.C.**  
15910 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 1600  
Encino, CA 91436  
Telephone: 818-839-2333  
rtellis@baronbudd.com

-8-



1 dfernandes@baronbudd.com

2 MELISSA YEATES  
3 **KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK**  
4 **LLP**  
5 280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD  
6 RADNOR, PA 19087  
7 Telephone: 610-667-7706  
8 myeates@ktmc.com

9 DIANDRA “FU” DEBROSSE ZIMMERMANN  
10 **DICELLO LEVITT**  
11 505 20th St North  
12 Suite 1500  
13 Birmingham, Alabama 35203  
14 Telephone: 205-855-5700  
15 fu@dicellolevitt.com

16 Plaintiffs’ Steering Committee Membership

17 *Attorneys for Individual Plaintiffs*  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

2 By: /s/ Ashley M. Simonsen  
3 Ashley M. Simonsen, SBN 275203  
4 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
5 1999 Avenue of the Stars  
6 Los Angeles, CA 90067  
7 Telephone: (424) 332-4800  
8 Facsimile: + 1 (424) 332-4749  
9 Email: asimonsen@cov.com

10 Phyllis A. Jones, *pro hac vice*  
11 Paul W. Schmidt, *pro hac vice*  
12 COVINGTON & BURLING LLP  
13 One City Center  
14 850 Tenth Street, NW  
15 Washington, DC 20001-4956  
16 Telephone: + 1 (202) 662-6000  
17 Facsimile: + 1 (202) 662-6291  
18 Email: pajones@cov.com

19 *Attorney for Defendants Meta Platforms, Inc.*  
20 *f/k/a Facebook, Inc.; Facebook Holdings,*  
21 *LLC; Facebook Operations, LLC; Facebook*  
22 *Payments, Inc.; Facebook Technologies, LLC;*  
23 *Instagram, LLC; Siculus, Inc.; and Mark Elliot*  
24 *Zuckerberg*

25 FAEGRE DRINKER LLP  
26 By: /s/ Andrea Roberts Pierson  
27 Andrea Roberts Pierson, *pro hac vice*  
28 FAEGRE DRINKER LLP  
300 N. Meridian Street, Suite 2500  
Indianapolis, IN 46204  
Telephone: + 1 (317) 237-0300  
Facsimile: + 1 (317) 237-1000  
Email: andrea.pierson@faegredrinker.com  
Email: amy.fiterman @faegredrinker.com

31 Amy R. Fiterman, *pro hac vice*  
32 FAEGRE DRINKER LLP  
33 2200 Wells Fargo Center  
34 90 South Seventh Street  
35 Minneapolis, MN 55402  
36 Telephone: +1 (612) 766-7768  
37 Facsimile: +1 (612) 766-1600  
38 Email: amy.fiterman@faegredrinker.com

-10-

Geoffrey Drake, *pro hac vice*  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
1180 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite 1600  
Atlanta, GA 30309  
Tel.: 404-572-4600  
Email: gdrake@kslaw.com  
Email: dmatter@kslaw.com

David Mattern, *pro ha vice*  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Suite 900  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Telephone: +1 (202) 626-2946  
Email: dmatter@kslaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendants TikTok Inc. and  
ByteDance Inc.*

MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSEN LLP  
By: /s/ Jonathan H. Blavin  
Jonathan H. Blavin, SBN 230269  
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP  
560 Mission Street, 27th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94105-3089  
Telephone: (415) 512-4000  
Facsimile: (415) 512-4077  
Email: jonathan.blavin@mto.com

Rose L. Ehler (SBN 29652)  
Victoria A. Degtyareva (SBN 284199)  
Laura M. Lopez, (SBN 313450)  
Ariel T. Teshuva (SBN 324238)  
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP  
350 South Grand Avenue, 50th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90071-3426  
Telephone: (213) 683-9100  
Facsimile: (213) 687-3702  
Email: rose.ehler@mto.com  
Email: victoria.degtyareva@mto.com  
Email: Ariel.Teshuva@mto.com

Lauren A. Bell (*pro hac vice*)  
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP  
601 Massachusetts Ave., NW St.,  
Suite 500 E  
Washington, D.C. 20001-5369

1 Telephone: (202) 220-1100  
2 Facsimile: (202) 220-2300  
3 Email: lauren.bell@mto.com

4 *Attorneys for Defendant Snap Inc.*

5 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI  
6 Professional Corporation

7 By: /s/ Brian M. Willen

8 Brian M. Willen (*pro hac vice*)

9 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI

10 1301 Avenue of the Americas, 40th Floor

11 New York, New York 10019

12 Telephone: (212) 999-5800

13 Facsimile: (212) 999-5899

14 Email: bwillen@wsgr.com

15 Lauren Gallo White (SBN 309075)

16 Samantha A. Machock (SBN 298852)

17 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI

18 One Market Plaza, Spear Tower, Suite 3300

19 San Francisco, CA 94105

20 Telephone: (415) 947-2000

21 Facsimile: (415) 947-2099

22 Email: lwhite@wsgr.com

23 Email: smachock@wsgr.com

24 Christopher Chiou (SBN 233587)

25 Matthew K. Donohue (SBN 302144)

26 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI

27 953 East Third Street, Suite 100

28 Los Angeles, CA 90013

Telephone: (323) 210-2900

Facsimile: (866) 974-7329

Email: cchiou@wsgr.com

Email: mdonohue@wsgr.com

*Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC and  
Google LLC*

WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP

By: /s/ Joseph G. Petrosinelli

Joseph G. Petrosinelli (*pro hac vice*)

jpetrosinelli@wc.com

Ashley W. Hardin (*pro hac vice*)

ahardin@wc.com

680 Maine Avenue, SW

-12-

1 Washington, DC 20024  
2 Telephone: 202-434-5000  
3 Fax: 202-434-5029

4 *Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC and  
Google LLC*

5 MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
6 By: /s/ Yardena R. Zwang-Weissman  
7 Yardena R. Zwang-Weissman (SBN 247111)  
8 300 South Grand Avenue, 22nd Floor  
9 Los Angeles, CA 90071-3132  
Tel.: 213.612.7238  
Email: yardena.zwang-  
weissman@morganlewis.com


10 Brian Ercole (*pro hac vice*)  
11 600 Brickell Avenue, Suite 1600  
12 Miami, FL 33131-3075  
13 Tel.: 305.415.3416  
Email: brian.ercole@morganlewis.com

14 Stephanie Schuster (*pro hac vice*)  
15 1111 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
16 NW Washington, DC 20004-2541  
Tel.: 202.373.6595  
Email: stephanie.schuster@morganlewis.com

17 *Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC and  
18 Google LLC*

19 **PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

20 Dated: July 26, 2024

21   
22 YVONNE GONZALEZ ROGERS  
23 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**ATTESTATION**

I, Lexi J. Hazam, hereby attest, pursuant to N.D. Cal. Civil L.R. 5-1, that the concurrence to the filing of this document has been obtained from each signatory hereto.

Dated: July 21, 2024

By: /s/Lexi J. Hazam